

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH REVIEW COMMISSION

SECRETARY OF LABOR

Complainant,

v.

SUMMIT CONTRACTORS, INC.

Respondent.

§
§
§
§
§
§
§
§

OSHRC DOCKET
No. 05-0839

REGION III

SUMMIT'S OPENING BRIEF ON REVIEW

Robert E. Rader, Jr.
2777 Stemmons Freeway
Stemmons Place, Suite 1125
Dallas, Texas 75207
(214) 630-4700

Attorney for Respondent

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | <u>Page(s)</u> |
|---|----------------|
| INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW | 1 |
| STATEMENT OF FACTS | 2 |
| STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES | 7 |
| ARGUMENT AND AUTHORITIES | 8 |
| | |
| FIRST ISSUE: DOES THE UNITED STATES SUPREME COURT'S DECISION IN <i>NATIONWIDE V. DARDEN</i> , 503 U.S. 318 (1992) REQUIRE THAT THE TERMS "EMPLOYER" AND "EMPLOYEE" IN THE OSH ACT BE DEFINED AS THE TRADITIONAL COMMON-LAW MASTER-SERVANT RELATIONSHIP? | 12 |
| | |
| SECOND ISSUE: DOES THE CITED STANDARD, 29 CFR 926.404 (b)(1)(ii), IMPOSE A DUTY ON SUMMIT TO ENSURE THAT THE EMPLOYEES OF SUBCONTRACTORS ARE PROVIDED GFCI PROTECTION? | 18 |
| | |
| THIRD ISSUE: DOES THE FACT THAT SUMMIT RENTED THE SPIDER BOX AS AN ACCOMMODATION TO ITS SUBCONTRACTOR ENLARGE SUMMIT'S LIABILITY UNDER THE STANDARD OR UNDER THE OSH ACT? | 19 |
| | |
| FOURTH ISSUE: EVEN IF SUMMIT WERE LIABLE UNDER THE STANDARD OR THE ACT, DID THE SECRETARY PROVE THE ELEMENT OF KNOWLEDGE? | 22 |
| | |
| CONCLUSION | 25 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

| | |
|---|---------------|
| <i>Anthony Crane Rental v. Reich</i> , 70 F.3d 1298 (D.C. Cir. 1995) | 26 |
| <i>Brennan v. Gillis and Cotting, Inc.</i> , 504 F.2d 1255 (4 th Cir. 1974) | 9 |
| <i>Cartier v. Doyle</i> , 277 F. 150 (5 th Cir. 1921) | 25 |
| <i>Clarkson Construction Co. v. OSHARC</i> , 531 F.2d 451 (10 th Cir. 1976) | 12 |
| <i>Community for Creative Non-Violence v. Reid</i> , 490 U.S. 730 (1989) | 13 |
| <i>Frohlick Crane Service, Inc. v. OSHRC</i> , 521 F.2d 628 (10 th Cir. 1975) | 25, 26 |
| <i>IBP, Inc. v. Herman</i> , 144 F.3d 861 (D.C. Cir. 1998) | 1, 21 |
| <i>Marshall v. Knutson Construction Co., and OSAHRC</i> , 566 F.2d 596 (8 th Cir. 1977) | 24 |
| <i>McQueen v. Salida Coca Cola Bottling Co.</i> , 652 F.Supp. 1471 (D. Colo. 1987) | 25 |
| <i>Nationwide Mutual Insurance v. Darden</i> , 503 U.S. 316 (1992) | <i>passim</i> |
| <i>Secretary of Labor v. Gillis and Cotting, Inc.</i> , 1 BNA OSHC 1388 (Rev. Comm. 1973) | 8 |

| | |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Secretary v. AAA Delivery Services, Inc.,</i> 21 BNA OSHC 1219 (Rev. Comm. 2005) | 16, 17, 18, 25 |
| <i>Secretary v. Access Equipment Systems, Inc.,</i> 18 BNA OSHC 1718 (Rev. Comm. 1999) | 12 |
| <i>Secretary v. Allstate Painting and Contracting Co.,</i> 21 BNA OSHC 1033 (Rev. Comm. 2005) | 16, 17, 25 |
| <i>Secretary v. Anning Johnson Company, Inc.,</i> 4 BNA OSHC 1193 (Rev. Comm. 1975) | 10, 11 |
| <i>Secretary v. CB&I Constructors, Inc.,</i> 20 BNA OSHC 1310 (Welsch, J. 2003) | 24 |
| <i>Secretary v. City Wide Tuckpointing Serv. Co.,</i> 1 BNA OSHC 1232 (Rev. Comm. 1973) | 9 |
| <i>Secretary v. David Weekley Homes,</i> 19 BNA OSHC 1116 (Rev. Comm. 2000) | 22, 24 |
| <i>Secretary v. Don Davis,</i> 19 BNA OSHC 1477 (Rev. Comm. 2001) | 15, 17, 25 |
| <i>Secretary v. Gelco Builders,</i> 6 BNA OSHC 1104 (Rev. Comm. 1977) | 11 |
| <i>Secretary v. Gil Haugan d/b/a Haugan Construction Co.,</i> 7 BNA OSHC 1004 (Rev. Comm. 1979) | 11 |
| <i>Secretary v. Grossman Steel & Aluminum Corp.,</i> 4 BNA OSHC 1185 (Rev. Comm. 1975) | 9, 10, 17 |
| <i>Secretary v. Harvey Workover, Inc.,</i> 7 BNA OSHC 1687 (Rev. Comm. 1979) | 11 |
| <i>Secretary v. Hawkins Construction Co.,</i> 1 BNA OSHC 1761 (Rev. Comm. 1974) | 9 |

| | |
|---|----------------|
| <i>Secretary v. Home Supply Company,</i> 1 BNA OSHC 1615 (Rev. Comm. 1974) | 8 |
| <i>Secretary v. James E. Roberts Company,</i> 1 BNA OSHC 1684 (Rev. Comm. 1974) | 9 |
| <i>Secretary v. Martin Iron Works, Inc.,</i> 2 BNA OSHC 1063 (Rev. Comm. 1974) | 9 |
| <i>Secretary v. McDevitt Street Bovis, Inc.,</i> 19 BNA OSHC 1108 (Rev. Comm. 2000) | 24 |
| <i>Secretary v. Red Lobster Inns,</i> 8 BNA OSHC 1762 (Rev. Comm. 1980) | 11 |
| <i>Secretary v. S&S Diving Company,</i> 8 BNA OSHC 2014 (Rev. Comm. 1980) | 12 |
| <i>Secretary v. Timothy Victory,</i> 18 BNA OSHC 1023 (Rev. Comm. 1997) | 14, 16, 17, 25 |
| <i>Secretary v. Vergona Crane Co.,</i> 15 BNA OSHC 1782 (Rev. Comm. 1992) | 14, 15, 25, 26 |
| <i>Southeast Contractors, Inc. v. Dunlop,</i> 512 F.2d 675 (5 th Cir. 1975) | 9 |
| <i>Trinity Industries, Inc. v. OSHRC,</i> 206 F.3d 539 (5 th Cir. 2000)..... | 22 |
| <i>United States v. Silk,</i> 331 U.S. 704 (1947) | 9, 13, 17 |

Statutes, Regulations and Authorities

29 U.S.C. § 658(a) 16

29 CFR 1926.12(a) 7, 26

29 CFR 1926.404(b)(1)(ii) 6, 7, 18

OSHA Instruction CPL 2-0.124 6